

# Thinking with stories of suffering: towards a living theory of response-ability

Jocelyn Carole Jones

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

University of Bath

School of Management

January 2008

Attention is drawn to the fact that copyright of this thesis rests with its author. This copy of the thesis has been supplied on condition that anyone who consults it is understood to recognise that its copyright rests with the author and that no quotation from the thesis and no information derived from it may be published without the prior consent of the author(s).

The thesis may be made available for consultation within the University Library and may be photocopied or lent to other libraries for the purposes of consultation.



## ABSTRACT

In the thesis I develop a living theory of responsibility, movement, engagement, withdrawal, and self care with a living standard of judgement of response-ability toward the other. I use a hermeneutic phenomenological approach to develop a dynamic, relational understanding, where social constructions are discussed and refined using cycles of loose and strict thinking, an inter-play of emotion and intellect, and a combination of intuitive and analytic reasoning. This is underpinned by an extended epistemology embracing experiential learning, documentary and textual analysis, presentational knowing, dialogue, narrative and photographic inquiry. I address the essence of inquiry with people who have difficult stories to tell and for us to comprehend: narratives which emerge from episodes of chaos and suffering, interspersed with occasional glimpses of the inter-human. Within this context I explore responsibility [response-ability] to 'the Other' as subject, and the ethical obligations implied in that relationship.

My and others' narratives, through space and over time, are researched using an extended epistemology and inquiry cycles across two interwoven strands. I look back over a long career and 'epiphanous' moments as a social worker and academic in the field of child protection and children and families work; and as the child of a war veteran, I reflect on World War II narratives of suffering, changing identity, and the inter-human. This first and second person inquiry extends outwards through cycles of dialogue with ex European prisoners of war and relation with landscape across Europe and Russia. In these reflections I clarify my meanings of chaos, suffering and responsibility [response-ability]. The learning from this extended inquiry and the contribution to knowledge are reflected on within my current practice as a participative researcher who is expressing response-ability toward the other. Finally, I consider implications for improving practice and organizational climate in children and families work.



# CONTENTS

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</b>   | <b>1</b>  |
| <b>STANDARDS OF JUDGEMENT</b>   | <b>5</b>  |
| <b>INTRODUCTION</b>   | <b>7</b>  |
| SCOPING THE TERRAIN: THE EXPERIENCES AND STORIES THAT SET THE SCENE         | 8         |
| CRAFTING THE RESEARCH ACCOUNT   | 13        |
| ETHICAL RESPONSIBILITIES  | 13        |
| A PRELIMINARY INTRODUCTION TO KEY IDEAS USED IN THE THESIS                  | 14        |
| OUTLINE OF CHAPTERS   | 15        |
| TEXT FORMATS  | 17        |
| PHOTOGRAPHS   | 17        |
| <b>CHAPTER ONE: THE PROFESSIONAL FOUNDATION</b>                             | <b>19</b> |
| INTRODUCTION  | 19        |
| REFLECTIONS ON THE EARLY DEVELOPMENT OF CHILD-CENTRED PRACTICE IN MY CAREER | 19        |
| A REFERRAL ON A SUNNY MONDAY IN THE SUMMER OF 1978                          | 20        |
| IN MANDY'S BEST INTERESTS   | 22        |
| GRAHAM  | 23        |
| RESPECT FOR PERSONS AND UNDERSTANDING POWER RELATIONSHIPS IN PRACTICE       | 31        |
| 'PROFESSIONAL ARTISTRY' AND CHILD PROTECTION                                | 33        |
| TO END  | 34        |
| <b>CHAPTER TWO: OF LOVE AND LOSS I</b>                                      | <b>37</b> |
| INTRODUCTION  | 37        |
| THINKING NARRATIVELY  | 37        |
| INITIAL ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS  | 39        |
| CARE OF THE SELF  | 40        |
| EARLY INQUIRIES INTO LOVE AND LOSS  | 43        |
| TO END  | 52        |
| <b>CHAPTER THREE: DEEPENING PROFESSIONAL UNDERSTANDING 1</b>                | <b>53</b> |
| INTRODUCTION  | 53        |
| A PARADIGM SHIFT BEGINS . . .   | 53        |
| STEPPING OUTSIDE MY COMFORT ZONE  | 55        |
| THE HEALING POWER OF NATURE: BEGINNINGS OF A PARTICIPATORY WORLDVIEW        | 58        |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| BECOMING AN ACTION RESEARCHER  | 59         |
| SELF CARE SURFACES FOR THE FIRST TIME  | 61         |
| SOME EARLY REFLECTIONS ON HYPOTHESIS FORMULATION   | 64         |
| EXTRACT FROM 'REFLECTIONS ON THE MAY TAPE' JUNE 2002                                     | 64         |
| TO END   | 67         |
| <b>CHAPTER FOUR: DEEPENING PROFESSIONAL UNDERSTANDING II</b>                             | <b>69</b>  |
| INTRODUCTION   | 69         |
| THE CLIMBIÉ INQUIRY: WHAT BEING 'MINDFUL' IN CHILD PROTECTION REALLY MEANS IN PRACTICE   | 70         |
| SELF CARE SURFACES FOR THE SECOND TIME   | 74         |
| ENTERING THE CHILD'S WORLD   | 75         |
| REFLECTION   | 78         |
| FIRST STEPS IN EMBRACING EMERGENCE   | 80         |
| MAPPING THE EMOTIONAL TERRAIN OF FAMILY PLACEMENT ASSESSMENT                             | 82         |
| ETHICAL ISSUES   | 84         |
| REFLECTION ON RESPONSE TO FINDINGS   | 86         |
| TO END   | 87         |
| <b>CHAPTER FIVE: OF LOVE AND LOSS II – INWARD, BACKWARD &amp; REFLECTION ON PLACE</b>    | <b>89</b>  |
| INTRODUCTION   | 89         |
| SELF-REFLECTIVE INQUIRY PRACTICES  | 90         |
| INQUIRY INTO THE LANDSCAPE OF WAR  | 90         |
| 60 <sup>TH</sup> ANNIVERSARY   | 95         |
| DEEPENING INQUIRY  | 101        |
| UNDERSTANDING "BELLEROPHON"  | 111        |
| SPACE AND SELF CARE  | 116        |
| TO END   | 121        |
| <b>CHAPTER SIX: OF LOVE AND LOSS III – MOVING IN THE THREE DIMENSIONAL INQUIRY SPACE</b> | <b>123</b> |
| INTRODUCTION   | 123        |
| INQUIRY WITH FORMER EUROPEAN PRISONERS OF WAR  | 123        |
| EXPERIENCING THE INTER-HUMAN   | 127        |
| NEW UNDERSTANDINGS OF PARTS AND THE WHOLE  | 128        |
| SUFFERING AND THE INTER-HUMAN: DEEPENING UNDERSTANDING                                   | 133        |
| REFLECTION, SELF CARE AND HEALING  | 136        |
| THE DIARIES RETURN AND A NEW NARRATIVE EMERGES   | 143        |
| REFLECTION   | 162        |
| RETURN TO OOSTERBEEK: NARRATIVES OF THEN AND NOW MEET IN PLACE                           | 164        |
| A DIFFERENT RELATIONSHIP TO PLACE IS FORMED: THINKING <i>WITH</i> STORIES AND IMAGES     | 172        |
| A NARRATIVE OF 'THE OTHER' IS HEARD  | 173        |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| LOOKED AT FROM THE OTHER SIDE OF THE NORTH SEA: NARRATIVES OF THEN AND NOW MEET IN PLACE                             | 173        |
| MORE STORIES OF SUFFERING ARE WITNESSED  | 175        |
| NARRATIVE OF 'THE OTHER' EMERGES   | 177        |
| RESPONSIBILITY, LEARNING AND THE INTER-HUMAN   | 201        |
| A FINAL RESPONSE TO NARRATIVES OF SUFFERING. . .   | 211        |
| TO END   | 215        |
| <br>   |            |
| <b>CHAPTER SEVEN: LIVING THEORY IN PROFESSIONAL PRACTICE</b>   | <b>217</b> |
| <br>   |            |
| INTRODUCTION   | 217        |
| RESPONSE AND RESPONSIBILITY: REVIEW OF THE LEARNING JOURNEY THUS FAR   | 218        |
| OVERVIEW OF THE EVALUATION   | 223        |
| REFLECTIVE COMMENTARY  | 230        |
| WHAT CHILDREN AND YOUNG PEOPLE AND PARENTS VALUED: RESPONSE-ABILITY AND THE INTER-HUMAN IN PRACTICE                  | 240        |
| WITNESSING THE RE-STORYING OF A LIFE   | 244        |
| PROFESSIONAL DISCOURSES IN EARLY INTERVENTION  | 247        |
| REFLECTION ON THE PROFESSIONAL DISCOURSES, ASSESSMENT AND RECORDING TOOLS  | 248        |
| TO END   | 255        |
| <br>   |            |
| <b>CHAPTER EIGHT: REFLECTIONS AND CONCLUDING COMMENTARY</b>  | <b>257</b> |
| <br>   |            |
| INTRODUCTION   | 257        |
| THE CONTRIBUTION OF HERMENEUTICS AND PHENOMENOLOGY   | 258        |
| A SENSORY APPROACH TO RECOGNITION AND RESPONSE   | 260        |
| NARRATIVE, RESPONSE AND RESPONSE-ABILITY   | 261        |
| MOVING BETWEEN STILLNESS AND ENGAGEMENT  | 264        |
| SELF CARE AND CULTIVATION OF THE SELF  | 265        |
| IMPLICATIONS FOR CHILDREN AND FAMILIES WORK  | 266        |
| THE PROCESS OF WRITING AND REPRESENTING THIS INQUIRY TO THE WORLD  | 271        |
| <br>   |            |
| <b>APPENDICES</b>  | <b>275</b> |
| <br>   |            |
| APPENDIX ONE: LETTER TO MY FATHER SENT AFTER UNCLE JACK'S FUNERAL ON 11 <sup>TH</sup> FEBRUARY 1992                  | 275        |
| APPENDIX TWO: A RESEARCH PROPOSAL TO IMPROVE THE QUALITY OF FAMILY PLACEMENT ASSESSMENTS                             | 277        |
| APPENDIX THREE: DIARY OF SIGNALMAN READ V.H.W. FOR PERIOD OF POW LIFE 17.09.44 – 20.04.45                            | 281        |
| APPENDIX FOUR: CORRESPONDENCE WITH NATIONAL Ex POW ASSOCIATION MAY - JUNE 2005                                       | 285        |
| APPENDIX FIVE: ACCOUNT OF TOM CARPENTER'S EXPERIENCES FROM 17.09.1944 TO LIBERATION IN 1945                          | 287        |
| APPENDIX SIX: STAN'S WAR – A PRISONER'S STORY  | 307        |
| APPENDIX SEVEN: PRISONER OF WAR LIBERATION QUESTIONNAIRE - READ VHW (WO344/264/2)                                    | 331        |
| APPENDIX EIGHT: CORRESPONDENCE RE NATIONAL ARCHIVES' RESEARCH 2005-2007  | 335        |
| APPENDIX NINE: FORMER CAMPS AND CEMETERY OF THE NAMELESS, FALLINGBOSTEL/OERBKE – MAPS AND PHOTOGRAPH OF RUSSIAN POWS | 337        |
| APPENDIX TEN: ARTICLE ON THE SHOOTING OF SGT. TOM HOLLINGSWORTH AT STALAG XIB, FALLINGBOSTEL                         | 341        |
| APPENDIX ELEVEN: TESTIMONY OF MAJOR SMITH, ROYAL ARMY MEDICAL CORPS (WO235/231)                                      | 343        |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>APPENDIX TWELVE: RED CROSS REPORT ON FALLINGBOSTEL 9<sup>TH</sup> NOVEMBER 1944 (FO916/836)</b>             | <b>353</b> |
| <b>APPENDIX THIRTEEN: ‘WALKING WOUNDED’ PROGRAMME, JERSEY ARTS CENTRE, MARCH/APRIL 2006</b>                    | <b>359</b> |
| <b>APPENDIX FOURTEEN: ‘AFTERWARDS’ BY FRED WALKER</b>  | <b>363</b> |
| <b>APPENDIX FIFTEEN: TESTIMONY FROM WAR CRIMES TRIALS IN THE SALZGITTER AREA (WO309/411)</b>                   | <b>365</b> |
| <b>APPENDIX SIXTEEN: MULTI-AGENCY REFERENCE GROUP -TERMS OF REFERENCE</b>                                      | <b>369</b> |
| <b>APPENDIX SEVENTEEN: EXCEL SPREADSHEET FOR MANAGING THE TEAM AROUND THE CHILD EVALUATION</b>                 | <b>371</b> |
| <b>APPENDIX EIGHTEEN: INFORMATION SHEETS ABOUT THE EVALUATION FOR YOUNG PEOPLE AND PARENTS</b>                 | <b>375</b> |
| <b>APPENDIX NINETEEN: ‘THANK YOU’ LETTER SENT TO CHILDREN AND YOUNG PEOPLE AFTER THE EVALUATION INTERVIEWS</b> | <b>379</b> |
| <b>APPENDIX TWENTY: ‘THANK YOU’ LETTERS SENT TO CHILDREN AND YOUNG PEOPLE AT THE END OF THE EVALUATION</b>     | <b>381</b> |
| <b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>  | <b>383</b> |

## **FIGURES**

|                            |            |
|----------------------------|------------|
| <b>FIGURE ONE: COLLAGE</b> | <b>10</b>  |
| <b>FIGURE TWO: MANDALA</b> | <b>274</b> |

## **CD**

**ARCHIVE FOOTAGE OF AIRBORNE TROOPS TAKING OFF FROM BARKSTON HEATH AIRFIELD FOR OPERATION MARKET GARDEN ON 17<sup>TH</sup> SEPTEMBER 1944**  
**VISUAL PRESENTATION FOR THE WORLD CONGRESS ON ACTION RESEARCH, GRONINGEN, NETHERLANDS, AUGUST 2006**  
**EXTRACT FROM INTERVIEW WITH STAN WADE, AUGUST 2006 (2 MINUTES)**

### **OPTIONAL ADDITIONAL RESOURCES TO SUPPORT THE READER:**

- i. HEART COHERENCE MEDITATION – QUIET PLACE TO SIT NEEDED (12 MINUTES)
- ii. ‘KINDNESS IN DAILY LIFE’ RELAXATION – QUIET PLACE, MAT & BLANKET NEEDED (15 MINUTES)
- iii. DAWN CHORUS IN JOCELYN’S GARDEN, 21<sup>ST</sup> JUNE 2007 (21 MINUTES)

# Acknowledgements

There are so many people who have contributed to the research journey of this thesis and to whom I am indebted for their contributions at different stages to my life. I would like to thank them for their practical support, enthusiasm, immense generosity, inspiring conversations, sense of humour, and the occasional well-delivered 'wake up' call.

To Prof. Olive Stevenson, University of Nottingham, the late Dr Teresa O'Neill, University of Bristol, Dr Jenny Kurinczuk, University of Oxford, Prof. Carol Jagger, University of Leicester, and Dr Mark Baldwin, University of Bath for their different contributions to the 'Team around the Child' evaluation, which forms the final part of the professional journey presented within this thesis.

To Prof. Liz Stanley, University of Edinburgh for her insightful feedback on my journal writing and thesis outline in September 2006.

To members of my Diploma/MPhil/PhD in Action Research & Vital Network Inquiry Groups for their critical friendship and contributions to my learning over the past six years – Jackie Draper, Dr Patricia Gaya-Wicks, Dr Alan George, Deborah Jones, Ian Nicholson, Kristen Richardson, Lynne Richmond, Dr Cathy Sharp, Patta Scott-Villiers, and Dr Svenja Tams.

To other members of the Centre for Action Research in Professional Practice community who have assisted and supported the research in different capacities – Chris Barnes, Sara Glennie, Dr Eleanor Lohr, Prof. Judi Marshall, Dr Sue Porter, Dr Chris Seeley, Prof. Peter Reason, Dr Jill Treseder, and Erica Whitfield.

To my three supervisors at Bath who contributed to the different stages of the research process – Dr Steve Taylor for asking very good questions at the beginning, Dr Donna Ladkin for her theoretical insights, and Dr Jack Whitehead for his encouragement, commitment to my learning, and critical feedback over the last twelve months.

---

I would like to express my gratitude to Colin McIntyre, the Salamander Oasis Trust and Trixie Harmer, daughter of the late Victor Selwyn of the Salamander Oasis Trust, the Lincolnshire Poacher, Bodley Head, and the National Archives, London for kind permission to cite the respectively copyrighted work within this thesis. Where I have referred to these works they are normally denoted by the usual copyright symbol © followed by the publisher's name and date of publication, where appropriate.

---

There are many other people who have contributed to this thesis, most of whom work outside of academia and publishing or have supported me in a personal capacity.

To the many strangers I met along the way for their responses and contributions to the research.

To Elaine Morton for her selection of flowers to feed my spirit during the dark winter months.

To Kate Brown for her influence on my early professional development as a student social worker, and for designing 'Jocelyn's Garden'.

To Jean Danford and Sarah King for our yoga sessions together, and for their different and distinctive contributions to the research over the past four years.

To Val and Graham Byers for welcoming me into their home, offering me a retreat to think and write during 2004-2006, and introducing me to the 'owls hunting in darkness' and those vast inspiring skies of Eastern England.

To Captain Ray McCollum of Barkston Heath airfield for his warm welcome when I turned up announced at the airfield in May 2006, his continuing interest in the research, and for giving permission to include the Barkston Heath 'Market Garden' archive footage from 17<sup>th</sup> September 1944 as part of the thesis.

To Allan Westall for his kind permission to include the photograph of his brother, Les, in Chapter Six. Les Westall was one of the men who did not return to England after leaving Barkston Heath in September 1944.

To Jean Jukes for her kind permission to use extracts from her late husband's, Bill Jukes' journal.

To Kevin Greenhalgh for giving up his lunch break to host Svenja's and my visit to the small yet fascinating Prisoner of War Museum at Fallingbostel, Germany in June 2006, and for sending on electronic copies of archive materials to me afterwards.

To Dr Thomas Thornborrow, University of Nottingham, a former paratrooper, for his heartfelt support, and for giving permission for me to use the 'contact' story from his PhD, in which he so vividly describes 'the sheer numbing brutality of no-holds-barred conflict'.

To Jack Higgins for writing the play 'Walking Wounded', and Jacqui Audrain for her direction of the world première at Jersey Arts Centre in March/April 2006. Thanks to both for their words of encouragement.

To Pete Mellett for sharing the influence of his father, who was also a Prisoner of War, on his life and for his interest in the research.

To Lidwine Janssens for helping take the research in a new direction in autumn 2006.

To Nick and Ammy de Oude for our friendship over the past twenty eight years and for welcoming me into their home in Groningen between the intense research in Oosterbeek and delivering the workshop at the World Congress on Action Research in Groningen, August 2006.

To Jan Peter and Onno Jansen van Galen for the longstanding friendship of our families, which was cemented over the years by my parents' trips to stay with their family in Oosterbeek, and their visits to our home 'Bellerophon' in North Warnborough, Hampshire.

To Rolf Keller, Head of Department, *Stiftung Niedersächsische Gedenkstätten*, which includes the archive of *Dokumentationsstelle Widerstand und Verfolgung 1939-1945 auf dem Gebiet des Landes Niedersachsen*, and to Elke Zacharias, *Gedenk- und Dokumentationsstätte KZ-Drütte*, Salzgitter, for their invaluable contributions to the research into the camps at Fallingbostel and at Hallendorf, where my father worked as a labourer at the Hermann Goering steelworks from November 1944 to April 1945. I would also like to express my gratitude to Rolf Keller for giving permission to reproduce the archive photograph of Russian Prisoners of War at Oerbke in Appendix Nine.

Although I have previously acknowledged the academic contribution of Dr Svenja Tams to the research, I would like to thank her personally for first suggesting our journey to the sites of my father's former prisoner of war camps in Germany and to the grave of one of her grandfathers who was killed in the closing stages of World War II. With her support and her parents' hospitality and loan of their car, the visit generated profound learning of place, emotion and experience. I will always treasure the memories of our journey together across the beautiful, lush German landscape in the warm sunshine of June 2006.

To all the ex Prisoners of War who contributed directly to this research in different ways - for their enduring sense of humour, warmth, honesty, and perhaps most importantly for their solidity as human beings who have been tested in ways most of us can barely imagine - Robbie Robinson for his support during the time of my father's terminal illness and death, Jack Baker, Tom Carpenter, Ernie Cox, Ged Crowe (and his wife, Lily), Reg Dowding, Ray Eaton, Dave Mowat, Bob Jones, Ron Jordan, Harry Salmon (and his partner, Liz), Sydney Seal, Stan Wade, and Gerd Wolse and others whose names I do not know, but whom I met at Mattierzoll, Germany, at the National ex PoW Association Reunions on the south coast of England, and at Arnhem Veterans' events in Birmingham.

I would like to express my gratitude to Gerd and his wife, Anna Wolse for their commitment to the research, and for their little gifts of support - 'a few things' Australian - which have sat by my computer throughout the writing in 2007. Special thanks are also due to Anna for her technical help, which made my correspondence and conversations with Gerd by email and Skype possible.

Finally amongst the men who were Prisoners of War, I am especially indebted to Tom Carpenter, Stan Wade and Gerd Wolse for sharing their personal journals and memoirs with me, and for their kind permission to reproduce their work in full as appendices and/or as extracts within the thesis. I could not have done this part of the research without the contribution of each and every one of them. I am grateful for the many hours we have spent talking and corresponding; for their patience in answering my questions as a person who has had the privilege to live at a very different historical time; for their generosity; and for their insightful comments on different aspects of the research, including writing, editing and some ethical issues.

---

To the children, parents, child care practitioners, managers and academics who I have met in a professional capacity and who have influenced my development in many different ways over the years - special thanks to the children - Mandy, Tracey, Jason, Graham and Suzie for touching my life.

To the Children's Community in Russia for re-introducing me to the wonders of the natural world.

To Panna Modi for our friendship over the past seventeen years, for her support during 2005, in particular, when I was first engaging with my father's war diaries, and for sharing with me her family's rich cultural and religious heritage which is a very special privilege.

To Jane Hulley and David Jones for offering me their home in Ludlow as a retreat to think, write, practice yoga, and get some fresh air in the Shropshire hills from time to time.

To Madge Bray, my co-conspirator in the 'Sweeties in Russia' episode, for being such a wonderful person and friend over the past 22 years.

To Peter Simmonds for his 'infectious enthusiasm' as we cycled out together in the lanes of Leicestershire during 2004-2006, and for his encouraging feedback on an earlier draft of the thesis.

To Katherine Tetlow for being the 'wise woman' in my life over the past five years.

To David Jones, my ex husband, for sharing his Jewish heritage with me and for our two beautiful daughters. I would also like to express my gratitude to David for the time in January 1982, when he stayed up all night and shared a bottle of whiskey with my father, Vic. Vic had just learnt that his closest Army mate, with whom he had shared everything as a prisoner of war, had recently died. Smudger's funeral had taken place only a day or two before our return from a family holiday in Portugal. Vic was extremely distraught to have missed it.

---

To my father, Vic Read, for his war narratives which taught me to value life, his great sense of humour, and for his enduring love as a person who was always looking out for you.

To Wendy Alder for sharing our childhood home 'Bellerophon', helping to supplement some gaps in my memory of our father's narratives, and for her sisterly love and support during the testing times of life.

To my mother, Lynn Read, for her love; for sharing her experiences of the difficult war years in Birkenhead and Liverpool; helping fill some of the gaps in Vic's war narratives; for her sense of humour; and not forgetting her great resilience and 'trooper' spirit which are an inspiration to us all.

Finally, I am indebted to two very special people - my daughters, Merlin and Rhiannon, for their wonderful support and enduring love. During the last six years of the research and writing, they have kept me going through the inevitable periods of self doubt; put up with my head being somewhere else a lot of the time; celebrated each achievement along the way; and helped me value the person I am.